

Minutes of a Meeting of the Planning Applications Committee held at Council Chamber, Surrey Heath House, Knoll Road, Camberley, GU15 3HD on 23 November 2023

+ Cllr Cliff Betton (Chair)
+ Cllr Victoria Wheeler (Vice Chair)

+ Cllr Shaun Garrett	+ Cllr John Skipper
+ Cllr Mary Glauert	+ Cllr Kevin Thompson
+ Cllr Nirmal Kang	+ Cllr David Whitcroft
+ Cllr Liz Noble	+ Cllr Helen Whitcroft
+ Cllr David O'Mahoney	+ Cllr Valerie White
- Cllr Ying Perrett	+ Cllr Richard Wilson
+ Cllr Murray Rowlands	

+ Present
- Apologies for absence presented

Members in Attendance: Sarbie Kang and Pat Tedder

Officers Present: Gavin Chinniah, Shannon Kimber, Eddie Scott and Sarah Shepherd, Melissa Turney

27/P Minutes of Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on 26 October 2023 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

28/P Application Number: 23/0672/FFU - Plot 3 Land West Of, Bullhousen Farm, Bisley Green, Bisley, Woking, Surrey

The application was for alterations to existing barn to include solar panels and windows, vehicular access with associated hardstanding and parking area, patio area and internal works to provide ancillary accommodation for workers in association with the farm. Installation of an underground sewage treatment plant.

The application would normally have been determined under the Council's Scheme of Delegation but had been reported to the Planning Applications Committee on the request of Councillor Liz Noble due to concerns that the proposal was out of keeping and was overdevelopment of the site.

Members were advised of the following updates on the application:

"Within the description of the proposal it states 'underground sewage treatment plant.' For clarification this relates to a septic tank.

The agent has agreed the pre-commencement conditions on behalf of the applicant.

Condition 6 has been amended to delete reference to the charging of e-bikes and to change from 'prior to commencement' of the development to prior to occupation. This now reads:

Prior to occupation of the development details of cycle parking in a robust, secure enclosure shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be constructed in accordance with the approved details and thereafter retained and maintained to the satisfaction of the Local Planning Authority."

As the application had triggered the Council's Public Speaking Scheme, as per Part 4 Section E of the Constitution, Mr Dean Guy, the agent, spoke in support of the application. Ms Rebecca Gengasamy; and Ms Nicki Rapley and Mr Steve Moore, who shared a public speaking slot, spoke in objection to the application.

Members had concerns relating to the significant overdevelopment of the site and the intensification of use in a greenbelt location, including the additional hardstanding and external lighting provision. It was noted that members of the Committee also felt that the intensified use of the site would have a detrimental impact on the associated footpath, which would be used to access the site.

The Officer recommendation to grant the application was proposed by Councillor Richard Wilson, seconded by Councillor Kevin Thompson and put to the vote and lost.

An alternative proposal to refuse the application was proposed by Councillor Victoria Wheeler, seconded by Councillor Shaun Garrett and was put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED that

- I. Application 23/0672 be refused for as it constituted inappropriate development within the greenbelt;**
- II. The Committee's concerns in relation the detrimental impact on the associated access footpath be detailed in the decision notice; and**
- III. The wording of the reasons for refusal be delegated to the Head of Planning in consultation with the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Committee and the relevant Ward Councillor.**

Note 1

It was noted for the record that:

- i. Councillor Liz Noble declared that she had a number of conversations in relation to the application but came into the meeting with an open-mind.
- ii. Councillor Liz Noble and other Committee Members had attended a Member Site Visit on the application.

Note 2

In line with Part 4 Section D, Paragraph 18 of the constitution, the voting in relation to the application was as follows:

Voting in favour of the Officer recommendation to grant the application:

Councillors Cliff Betton, Mary Glauert, Nirmal Kang, David O'Mahoney, Kevin Thompson, David Whitcroft and Richard Wilson.

Voting against the Officer recommendation to grant the application:

Councillors Shaun Garrett, Liz Noble, Murray Rowlands, John Skipper, Victoria Wheeler, Helen Whitcroft and Valerie White.

The Chair's casting vote was used against the Officer recommendation to grant the application, and as a result the recommendation fell.

Voting in favour of the alternative proposal to refuse the application:

Councillors Cliff Betton, Shaun Garrett, Mary Glauert, Liz Noble, David O'Mahoney, Murray Rowlands, John Skipper, Victoria Wheeler, Helen Whitcroft and Valerie White.

Voting against the alternative proposal to refuse the application:

Councillors Kevin Thompson, David Whitcroft and Richard Wilson.

Voting in abstention in relation to the alternative proposal to grant the application:

Councillor Nirmal Kang.

Note 3

It was noted, at the Chair's request, that he was consistent in using his Chair's casting vote, in favour of the maintenance of the status quo.

29/P Application Number: 23/0936/FFU - Cedars Garden Nursery , Church Road, Windlesham, Surrey, GU20 6BL

The application was for the erection of a dwelling, following demolition of existing glasshouse, office and ancillary buildings associated with the commercial plant nursery.

The application would have normally been determined under the Council's Scheme of Delegation but it had been reported to the Planning Applications Committee on the request of Councillor Victoria Wheeler due to concerns that the proposal was inappropriate development in the Green Belt.

Members were advised of the following updates on the application:

"The agent has agreed the pre-commencement conditions on behalf of the applicant.

An amended plan has been received to alter the size of the parking spaces to comply with the Windlesham Neighbourhood Plan. Condition 2 has been amended with an updated plan number (change in bold):

The proposed development shall be built in accordance with the following approved plans:

OV/DB/TOC/01A Received 18.10.2023

OV/DB/TOC/02A Received 18.10.2023

OV/DB/TOC/03A Received 18.10.2023

OV/DB/TOC/04B Received 21.11.2023

Location Plan Received 06.09.2023

CWLD-TOC-CGN-LA-2332-01 Received 06.09.2023

Condition 11 has been amended to include removal of Class AA (enlargement of a dwellinghouse by construction of additional storeys) permitted development rights:

*Notwithstanding the provisions of **Class AA**, Class A, Class B and Class E of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 (as amended) (or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order) no further extensions, roof alterations, outbuildings shall be erected or undertaken without the prior approval in writing of the Local Planning Authority.*

Any development under the Classes stated above undertaken or implemented between the date of this decision and the commencement of the development hereby approved shall be demolished and all material debris resulting permanently removed from the land within one month of the development hereby approved coming into first use."

The Committee had concerns as to the potential effect of the proposal on the visual amenities of the area, and in particular the rural character of the Church Road Conservation Area. As a result it was agreed to add additional conditions to the Officer recommendation to remove the permitted development rights for additional walls and fencing; and to stipulate agreement of a landscaping plan with the planning authority, with the intent to retain the already existent hedges and boundary treatment on the site.

RESOLVED that application 23/0936 be granted subject to the conditions in the Officer report and the two additional conditions.

Note 1

As per Part 4 Section D, paragraph 18 of the constitution, the voting in relation to the application was as follows:

Voting in favour of the officer recommendation, as amended, to grant the application:

Councillors Cliff Betton, Mary Glauert, Nirmal Kang, David O'Mahoney, Murray Rowlands, Kevin Thompson and David Whitcroft.

Voting against the officer recommendation, as amended, to grant the application:

Councillors Shaun Garrett, John Skipper and Victoria Wheeler.

Voting in abstention against the officer recommendation, as amended, to grant the application:

Councillor Liz Noble.

30/P Application Number: 23/1019/FFU - 9 Ashwell Avenue, Camberley, Surrey, GU15 2AR

The application was for a garage conversion into habitable accommodation, along with fenestration alterations.

The application would normally have been determined under the Council's Scheme of Delegation but it was being reported to the Planning Applications Committee because the applicant was a Councillor.

Members were advised of the following updates in relation to the application:

“One additional comment has been received. Following the receipt of amended plans and the revised description, with the removal of the single storey rear extension from the development, the occupiers of a neighbouring dwelling have stated that they have no objections to the revised plans.”

RESOLVED that application 23/2019 be granted subject to the conditions outlined in the Officer Report

Note 1

Councillor Cliff Betton declared that due to his close relationship with the applicant and that he had visited the property several times, he could not take part in the consideration of the application and left the room accordingly. As a result Councillor Victoria Wheeler chaired the consideration of the application.

Note 2

It was noted for the record that Councillor Victoria Wheeler declared that as a serving Councillor, all members of the Committee knew the applicant, but came into the meeting with an open-mind.

Note 3

In line with Part 4 Section D, Paragraph 18 of the Constitution, the voting in relation to the application was as follows:

Voting in favour of the Officer recommendation to grant the application:

Councillors Shaun Garrett, Mary Glauert, Nirmal Kang, Liz Noble, David O'Mahoney, Murray Rowlands, John Skipper, Kevin Thompson, Victoria Wheeler, David Whitcroft, Valerie White and Richard Wilson.

Chair